

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission

September 12, 2024 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes

A recording of this meeting is available on the Village of Oak Park Website: <https://www.oak-park.us/your-government/citizen-commissions/commission-tv>

Roll Call

Present: Chair Lou Garapolo and Commissioners Amy Peterson, David Bates, Scot Mazur, Paul Ribera, Ron Roman, Mark Weiner, Jessica Paul, Asha Andriana and Rachel Michelin
Absent: None.
Staff: Craig Failor, Village Planner / Planning and Urban Design Manager and Courtney Willits, Commission Attorney

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Roman to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 10-0.

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Weiner to approve the minutes from August 8, 2024. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 10-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None.

Other Business

Legal Review on Voting Procedures: Attorney Willits provided a brief overview of the memorandum prepared which details the vote needed relative to applicable application processes. It was noted that the Historic Preservation Ordinance only requires a majority of a quorum (4) for approval of any COA application and a majority (6) for approval of COEH and Landmark applications. The Chair asked that this matter be discussed at their next regular meeting relative to drafting an amendment to the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Village Planner Failor indicated, at the end of the meeting, the Village has hired the Urban Planner position and liaison to the HPC who will start on Monday, September 16, 2024.

Chair Garapolo requested that their regular meetings be moved to Community Room 101 as the dais will not allow a full commission, staff and attorney to sit at the dais. Village Planner Failor indicated consultation with the Clerks office was needed.

Chair Garapolo asked that staff pursue additional speakers for the Speaker's Series and suggested contacting the Chair of the Maywood, IL Historic Preservation Commission.

Regular Agenda

ADVISORY REVIEW: 1032 Erie Ave (Sahitya Denduluri): Advisory Review relative to the construction a new 2-car garage replacing a non-contributing four car garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Village Planner Failor provided an overview of the application.

Architect Frank Heitzman presented the designs for the proposed garage. The Commission discussed possible modifications to the garage design and sought agreement on providing a wider fascia band along the top edge similar to that of the existing house, providing a hip roof with a taller pitch similar to the residence, use of beveled cedar siding similar to the residence, windows should be a one pane over one pane design verse a three pane over one pane design and use paint colors to match the house.

HPC2024-19 - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: 304 N Scoville Ave (Jonathan & Lauren Talbert): Demolition of a historic brick garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Village Planner Failor provided an overview of both applications for this address. Chair Garapolo opened the agenda item for discussion.

Homeowner Jonathan Talbert provided an overview of the project indicating that the cost to repair the original portion of the garage would be very expensive and not economical due to the need to dismantle the garage walls and rebuild. The submitted structural report substantiated the severe structural issues. Mr. Talbert went into detail on the process that would be required to repair. He also indicated that the garage was not functional due to is narrow profile. The Commission discussed the repair scenario and understood the extensiveness and extreme cost to repair the garage.

Commissioner Roman made a motion to approve the demolition of the historic garage as well as the noncontributing portion of the garage. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Roman, Andriana, Peterson, Weiner, Michelin, Mazur, Bates, Ribera, Paul and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

ADVISORY REVIEW: 304 N Scoville Ave (Jonathan & Lauren Talbert): Advisory Review relative to the construction of a new three car garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

After the approval to demolish the garage, Mr. Talbert provided an overview of the proposed replacement garage. He indicated that the proposed 3 car garage was of a better design and complemented the existing residence. The Commission reviewed the drawings and recommended that the roof shingles match the color of the residence roof, the use of LP Smart siding be considered and that a 14-inch overhang be designed similar to that of the residence. They also discussed the garage door paneling should be consistent for both doors. Mr. Talbert accepted all the recommendations.

ADVISORY REVIEW: 208-230 N Oak Park Ave (Santa Maria Condominiums): Advisory Review to seek direction on a change in material for multiple historic balconies (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Ms. Rachel Will, *Wiss, Janney, Elstner Associates, Inc.* provided an overview of the proposal indicating that the preference for material is terra cotta, but due to the delivery timeframe and immediate need

for repair of the Juliette balconies, the use of fiberglass reinforced concrete (FGRC) is their preferred alternative. She indicated that this project has been in need for several year, but the condominium association had to consider what the right approach was and spread out the cost. She indicated that about 30% of the balconies would need to be replaced with FGRC. It was stated that the FGRC could be manufactured to match existing colors and sheen. In fact, it would be a better match in color than terra cotta. The Commission discussed this matter and felt that FGRC would be a good alternative considering all that was stated by Ms. Will. The Commission would like to see a sample of the product at some point in the future. The Commission asked about the cost between terra cotta and FGRC, which Ms. Will indicated they were comparable. The Commission supported the use of FGRC.

HPC2024-17 - PUBLIC HEARING: 631 Forest Avenue (Anthony & Candice Drew): The property owner has requested a public hearing for the addition of a side porch (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Village Planner Failor provided an overview of the application and indicated that public notice was provided in the newspaper and letters to the neighbors.

Architect Jim Vanderheyden presented an overview of the full historic review process starting in late 2023 which included interactions with the ARC and HPC and a public hearing in November 2023, through the August 2024 HPC meeting. He submitted 26 exhibits for consideration, which were read into the record by Village Planner Failor. Mr. Vanderheyden believes that the new design for the side porch captured a better design solution for the porch and meets the historic preservation guidelines for porches. The new design was all wood with no stucco at the base. He indicates that several neighbors support the porch addition as indicated in the submitted petition.

Homeowner Candice Drew stated her review of the process to-date indicating that they were not trying to undermine the previous approval process. She researched other houses with similar side additions and provided photographs. Homeowner Anthony Drew stated that the porch is a desire for this type of addition where they can enjoy the outdoors.

The Commission Chair proceeded through the public hearing procedures and ended with Commission deliberations. Chair Garapolo indicated that the list of supporting neighbors be stricken from the hearing due to the fact the applicant could not confirm whether the neighbors support the former design or the proposed design.

Attorney Willits pointed out that the commission can overturn the Chair's decision if they so choose.

Commissioner Ribera made a motion to accept the petition from the neighbors and overturn the Chair's decision to exclude the document from submission. Commissioner Peterson seconded the motion. The motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Ribera, Peterson, Mazur, Weiner, Bates, Roman, Michelin, and Paul.

NAY: Commissioner Andriana and Chair Garapolo.

Closing comments by the Applicant were made by homeowner Anthony Drew stating that they met the commission's feedback and want the best for their home and family.

The Commission deliberated and some stated that they appreciated the stewardship from the homeowner and their dedication to the process. Some Commissioners stated that the new design was more in keeping with the design guidelines than the former design. Some Commissioners felt the porch took away from the historic bungalow with the addition's encroachment further towards the front of the house engulfing the historic structure.

Commissioner Andriana made a motion to approve the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Weiner. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Andriana, Weiner, Mazur, Bates, Ribera, Michelin, Paul and Chair Garapolo

NAY: Commissioners Peterson and Roman

Commissioner Peterson made a motion to approve the Resolution (to be completed by staff). Seconded by Commissioner Andriana. The motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Peterson, Andriana, Weiner, Mazur, Bates, Ribera, Roman, Michelin, Paul and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Peterson to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Michelin.

The meeting adjourned at 9:51 PM.

Minutes prepared by Craig Failor, Village Planner / Planning & Urban Design Manager.