

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission

October 10, 2024 at 7:30PM – Meeting Minutes

A recording of this meeting is available on the Village of Oak Park Website: <https://www.oak-park.us/your-government/citizen-commissions/commission-tv>

Roll Call

Present: Chair Lou Garapolo and Commissioners David Bates, Scot Mazur, Paul Ribera, Ron Roman, Jessica Paul, Asha Andriana and Rachel Michelin
Absent: Commissioners Amy Peterson and Mark Weiner
Staff: Atefa Ghaznawi, Urban Planner and Craig Failor, Village Planner / Planning and Urban Design Manager

Agenda Approval

Motion by Chair Garapolo Commissioner to approve the agenda. Motion approved 8-0.

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Andriana to approve the minutes from September 12, 2024. Second by Commissioner Mazur. Motion approved 8-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None.

Regular Agenda

ADVISORY REVIEW: 122 Pleasant St (Russel Carter & Eric Ullrich): Advisory Review to Install solar panels on front roof slope (*Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District*).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of the application.

Homeowner Russel Carter & Contractor Eric Ullrich presented the designs for the proposed solar panels project. The Commission discussed possibility of relocating the solar panels proposed on the front facing roof slope, which will be visible from the street, to alternative locations. Mr. Ullrich stated: "Better solar access at the front facing roof slope that is south facing, is the most solar viable. East and west roof slopes are maxed out, garage is significantly smaller, shaded, and with less solar access. To minimize aesthetic impacts, we have an option of all monochromatic equipment design, panels are black on black with color matched black attachments and rails. The whole system will be monochromatic with raised skirt to hide the attachments, basically blending in with the roof projections. We typically do exterior conduits to connect the different arrays, we can do interior conduits as well to see the main array on the roof only. We could look into raised skirts, row sheets that covers the front profile of the array, which tapers it into the roof. In case of interior conduits, we will have an additional junction box under each array that brings the wiring into the deck, and there will be interior pipes into the attic. It is called a solar deck, a small junction box that is flashed up underneath the row of shingles and above it. It has a little apron that is flashed underneath the shingles."

The Commission requested the applicant to attend the ARC Meeting on October 24, 2024 and provide the following additional information:

- Provide renderings/ examples of a monochromatic equipment design (panels are black on black, color matched black attachments and rails, etc.) from the contractor's previous projects that have raised skirt to hide the attachments that blends in with the roof projections.
- Incorporate interior conduits instead of exterior conduits to see only the main array on the roof
- If possible, relocate the solar panels proposed on the front facing roof slope, which will be visible from the street, to alternative locations.

ADVISORY REVIEW: 816 N Oak Park Ave (DAN BERRD MATUSZEWSKI / ELIZABETH NICOLE CALDWELL)

Advisory Review to replace 11 exterior windows with no size change (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of the application.

Mr. Paul the project design consultant from Renewal by Anderson Windows presented the designs for the proposed window replacements. Mr. Paul stated: "The contractor did an exterior inspection. Due to water damage the lower level boards are completely rotten out. They will match the colors like for like. The front windows will be replaced with two operating casement windows on the sides and one fixed panel in the center. The picture window will add more glass and visibility. It is called the Chicago style and is very common." The Commission recommended keeping the same look of the existing windows. The Commission indicated they have a major concern as the windows are major character defining features in the historic property, and the consultant does not replicate the look. Therefore, replacing the windows in kind, or repairing the existing windows is encouraged. The Commission requested the design consultant and the homeowner to attend the ARC Meeting on October 24, 2024 and provide the following additional information:

- Make new windows look like the historic windows that are visible from the street, and match critical details such as size, shape, operation, glass (muntin) configuration, profiles, material, and finish. They should operate in the same manner as the historic windows and should be the same material.
- Provide photos of the deterioration and extend of damages that are beyond repair.
- For windows visible form the street, replicate the 3/1 window grid, add window muntin, and keep the existing proportion of grouped three-window pattern.

HPC2024-20 - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: 240 S Euclid Ave (Bill Blankemeier): Demolition of a historic garage (Ridgeland - Oak Park Historic District).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of both applications for this address. Chair Garapolo opened the agenda item for discussion.

The Commission indicated that the homeowner attended the ARC Meeting on September 26, 2024. Homeowner Bill Blankemeier provided an overview of the project indicating that the existing garage roof, ceiling, flooring, walls, foundation, etc. are very deteriorated and the cost to repair the existing garage would be very expensive and not economical. The submitted structural report substantiated the severe structural issues. Mr. Blankemeier went into detail on the process that would be required to repair and the cost of repair vs constructing a new garage. He also indicated that the garage was not functional due to several structural and safety issues.

The Commission indicated that the structural report and cost estimates are thorough and meet the requirements for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition.

Commissioner Michelin made a motion to approve the demolition of the historic garage. Second by Commissioner Mazer. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Michelin, Mazer, Andriana, Bates, Roman, Paul, Ribera, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

ADVISORY REVIEW: 240 S Euclid Ave (Bill Blankemeier): Advisory Review relative to the construction of a new car garage (*Ridgeland - Oak Park Historic District*).

After the approval to demolish the garage, Mr. Blankemeier and Contractor David provided an overview of the proposed replacement garage. He indicated that the proposed 2 car garage was of a better design and complemented the existing residence. The Commission reviewed the drawings and appreciated the homeowner's efforts to match the design of the new garage with the house. The commission recommended changing the dormer's siding from shingles to stucco to match the house and rest of the new garage. Mr. Blankemeier accepted all the recommendations.

HPC2024-21 - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: 174 N Taylor Ave (Vince Leung and Ivy Penfield): Demolition of a historic garage (*Ridgeland - Oak Park Historic District*).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of both applications for this address. Chair Garapolo opened the agenda item for discussion.

The Commission indicated that the homeowner attended the ARC Meeting on September 26, 2024. Homeowner Vince Leung provided an overview of the project indicating that the existing garage roof, ceiling, flooring, walls, foundation, etc. are very deteriorated and the cost to repair the existing garage would be very expensive and not economical. The submitted structural report substantiated the severe structural issues. Mr. Leung went into detail on the process that would be required to repair and the cost of repair vs constructing a new garage. He also indicated that the garage was not functional due to several structural and safety issues.

The Commission indicated that the structural report and cost estimates are thorough and meet the requirements for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition.

Commissioner Andriana made a motion to approve the demolition of the historic garage. Second by Commissioner Mazer. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Andriana, Mazer, Bates, Roman, Paul, Ribera, Michelin, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

ADVISORY REVIEW: 174 N Taylor Ave (Vince Leung and Ivy Penfield): Advisory Review relative to the construction of a new car garage (*Ridgeland - Oak Park Historic District*).

After the approval to demolish the garage, Mr. Leung provided an overview of the proposed replacement garage. He indicated that the proposed 2 car garage was of a better design and complemented the existing residence. During the ARC Meeting on September 26, 2024, the Committee recommended reducing the size of the dormer because as per the Architectural Guidelines the size of the dormer should not be more than 50% of the roof slope on which it is located. The homeowners modified the dormer

design and reduced its width from 24 ft to 20 ft and presented the revised design to the Commission. The commission recommended considering the use of 3-inch LP Smart siding instead of 3-inch vinyl siding, double-hung windows instead of casement to match the house, and matching the dormer style with the dormers of the house. The homeowner explained a bigger dormer size can accommodate the staircase. The homeowners accepted all the recommendations.

HPC2024-22 - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: 629 N Grove Ave (Eduardo Salgado): Demolition of a historic garage (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of both applications for this address. Chair Garapolo made a motion to open the agenda item for discussion.

Contractor Eduardo Salgado provided an overview of the project indicating that the existing garage roof, ceiling, flooring, walls, foundation, etc. are very deteriorated and the cost to repair the existing garage would be very expensive and not economical. The submitted structural report substantiated the severe structural issues. Mr. Salgado went into detail on the process that would be required to repair and the cost of repair vs constructing a new garage. He also indicated that the garage was not functional due to several structural and safety issues.

The Commission indicated that the structural report and cost estimates are thorough and meet the requirements for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition.

Commissioner Andriana made a motion to approve the demolition of the historic garage. Second by Commissioner Roman. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Andriana, Roman, Mazer, Bates, Paul, Ribera, and Michelin

NAY: Chair Garapolo

HPC2024-23 - CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS: 517 N Euclid Ave (Ruben Jaime): Renovation of a historic front porch and demolition of historic material (*Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District*).

Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of both applications for this address. Chair Garapolo made a motion to open the agenda item for discussion, second by Commissioner Roman.

Contractor Ruben Jaime provided an overview of the project indicating that the existing front porch. Mr. Ruben explained that the structural parts of the existing porch such as beams, ceiling, and flooring are in deteriorated condition and should be replaced. Mr. Ruben presented a structural assessment report from Olympic Engineering, and photos of the existing porch. Mr. Ruben stated that he will remove, clean and place back all decorative elements such as ornamental motifs, columns and capitals, moldings, vintage corbellings, brackets, dentils, etc. The commission asked about the size of the flooring will change from 1"x3" to 2"x6". The contractor stated that the new flooring has 2-inch thickness which will provide more structural support and is more durable during winter and freezing. The commission asked the reason for using pine material for flooring. Contractor stated that pine is the only material available in the market that has 2-inch thickness.

The Commission indicated that the renovation proposal for the historic porch meets the requirements for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition.

Commissioner Roman made a motion to approve the demolition of the historic material. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion was approved by a roll call vote as follows:

AYE: Commissioners Roman, Andriana, Mazer, Bates, Paul, Ribera, Michelin, and Chair Garapolo

NAY: None

Other Business

Seek Direction to Amend the Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Voting Procedures:

As a follow-up to the discussion from HPC meeting on September 12, 2024 regarding amendment to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, COA Voting Procedures, Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of the amended ordinance. In Section 7-9-12: Procedures for Certificate of Appropriateness, sub-section E and F, *“a majority of a quorum of the Commission”* for approval and denial of any COA application was changed to *“a quorum of the Commission”*. The Commission reviewed the amended Ordinance, approved the amendment, and requested the amended Ordinance to be sent to the Village Board for approval.

Motion by Commissioner Michelin to amend the Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding Voting Procedures Second by Commissioner Ribera. Motion approved 8-0.

Discuss 2025 HPC Work Plan: Urban Planner Ghaznawi provided an overview of the 2025 HPC Work Plan. The Commission decided to review the proposed Work Plan and provide feedback and comments during the HPC Meeting on November 14, 2024.

Speaker Series Update: Urban Planner Ghaznawi, indicated as a continuation of 2024 Speaker Series, at the next HPC meeting on November 14, the Chair of City of Maywood Historic Preservation Commission has been invited to give a presentation about how the City of Maywood preserves and protects Maywood’s historic resources by creating awareness of its heritage and values, the processes, challenges and future plans

2024 Historic Preservation Awards Update: Urban Planner Ghaznawi indicated if anyone from the Commission would like to nominate any project for this year’s Historic Preservation Awards, and if anyone from the Commission is interested to participate as a panelist for this year’s Historic Preservation Awards. There will be a total of four panelists, three of which have been confirmed. An in-person guided tour has been scheduled for Saturday Oct 19, 2024 to visit and evaluate the projects, and lunch will be provided. Commissioner Michelin stated she is interested to participate as a panelist for the 2024 HP Awards, and she will confirm with the staff liaison if she can attend the in-person tour on October 19, 2024.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Andriana to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Ribera.

The meeting adjourned at 9:30 PM.

Minutes prepared by Atefa Ghaznawi, Urban Planner.