



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION – STAFF REPORT

Address: **238 S. KENILWORTH AVENUE**
Meeting Date: January 12, 2017
Property OwnerS: Tom and Michelle Gill
Architect: Chris Wollmuth Design
Historic Designation: *Ridgeland/Oak Park Historic District*
Construction Date: pre-1895
Zoning: R4 – Single-Family Residential
Project Description: Construct a two-story frame addition on the rear and south side
Guidelines: New Addition Policy



Architectural Review Guidelines

The purpose for architectural review is to protect the unique visual qualities of a building and its site that define their sense of history from inappropriate proposed alterations that will reduce that sense.

The relevant items from the New Addition Policy state the following:

1. *New additions in historic districts must be compatible with the size, scale, set-back, massing, material, and character of the building to which it is attached.*
2. *New additions shall not remove significant character-defining features or historic material visible from the street.*
3. *To minimize impact of an addition on the historic building, additions shall be constructed on a secondary or tertiary facade.*
4. *New additions shall not change the historic character of the building.*
5. *New additions shall protect the historic significance of the building by making a visual distinction between old and new.*

Staff Comments

The proposed side two-story addition is extend the south bay out into the side yard along the back of the wrap-around porch, which was added in 2011 and is not original to the house. The existing south bay has diagonal bay walls on the first floor and squared walls on the second floor. The house is clad in wood clapboard with wood shingles in the gable ends. They are proposing to use three types of siding – wider at the base – to delineate that it is a new addition.

The architect met with the Architectural Review Committee on November 26. The ARC recommended that they delineate the side addition in materials and use trim board, and add a base/water table in different in materials to make the addition more grounded. The also suggested using the same detailing like wood trim and trim around the windows on the addition to mimic a more covered bay. The applicants have done this by using a wider siding at the base, a narrower siding on the first floor of the addition, and shingles on the second floor.

The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the Certificate of Appropriateness at their meeting on December 8, 2016. At that meeting the Commission determined that the proposed addition would remove the side bay, which they felt is a character-defining feature, and therefore did not meet the New Addition Policy of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

The applicant requested a public hearing on December 21, 2016.

The extension of the bay outwards significantly alters the proportion of the bay, removes the historic angled characteristic, and changes the historic character of the house. This house is one of four very similar houses at the south end of Kenilworth Avenue, with cross-gabled side bays and angled facades. These include the house to the south at 242 S. Kenilworth, and the houses across the street at 239 and 243 S. Kenilworth. All three incorporate the same south bay with angled facades. The Guidelines recommend looking at historic contextual character, including massing and street rhythm. By removing the angled façade, which is most likely an original feature based on the existence of the three surrounding houses, and extending this bay out into the side yard 8-12 feet, the historic contextual character and street rhythm is being altered. As such, the project as proposed does not meet the Architectural Review Guidelines, specifically nos. 1, 2 and 4 of the New Addition Policy.

Staff Recommendations:

Staff recommends that the Commission deny the Certificate of Appropriateness application, per Section 7-9-13(G) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Attachments

Attached for your review are the following documents:

- Certificate of Appropriateness application dated November 30, 2016
- Plans and elevations from CW Design dated November 30, 2016
- Project Summary from CW Design dated December 1, 2016
- Correspondence to applicant following HPC meeting dated December 13, 2016
- Correspondence from applicant requesting public hearing dated December 21, 2016
- Legal Notice, Notice to owners, Notice to property owners within 250 feet
- Photographs of property
- Minutes of the December 8 Historic Preservation Commission meeting
- Public Comment (one letter)



238 S. Kenilworth Avenue



242 S. Kenilworth Avenue



239 S. Kenilworth Avenue



243 S. Kenilworth Avenue